

Rating the Raters – Strengths and Weaknesses Assessment of the Four Public Hospital Quality Rating Systems

The comments in the table below reflect the discussion that the Rating-the-Raters group had about each rating system. These comments for each rating system were provided to the leaders of that rating system to solicit feedback.

Audit Information

(CMS) Hospital Compare Overall Star Ratings	Healthgrades Top Hospitals	USNWR (U.S. News & World Report) Best Hospitals	Leapfrog Hospital Safety Grade and Leapfrog Top Hospitals
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CMS will validate up to eight cases for clinical process of care measures per quarter per selected hospital. Cases are randomly selected from data submitted to the warehouse by the hospital • CMS will validate up to 10 candidate hospital acquired infection (HAI) cases total per quarter per selected hospital • Each quarter, the Clinical Data Abstraction Center (CDAC) will send hospitals a written request to Medical Records Director to submit a patient medical record for each case and candidate case that CMS selected for validation • If a hospital does not meet the overall validation requirement, the hospital will not receive full credit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not applicable (uses claims data from CMS) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not applicable (uses data from other sources) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leapfrog gives hospitals opportunity to review data, but assumes no responsibility for accuracy of data from elsewhere (CMS, AHA) • Data review/check for erroneous values completed • An internal Leapfrog data review is conducted monthly after submission from hospitals • Hospitals are randomly selected to submit documentation demonstrating adherence to NQF safe practices and Never Events policy • Contracted with DHG Healthcare to conduct in-hospital data verification for selected hospitals • Very few hospitals are audited annually and audit results are not released

Source: The Authors. Details of the rating process are available at www.RatingTheRaters.org

NEJM Catalyst (catalyst.nejm.org) © Massachusetts Medical Society