

Rating the Raters – Strengths and Weaknesses Assessment of the Four Public Hospital Quality Rating Systems

The comments in the table below reflect the discussion that the Rating-the-Raters group had about each rating system. These comments for each rating system were provided to the leaders of that rating system to solicit feedback.

Transparency

(CMS) Hospital Compare Overall Star Ratings	Healthgrades Top Hospitals	USNWR (U.S. News & World Report) Best Hospitals	Leapfrog Hospital Safety Grade and Leapfrog Top Hospitals
Pro			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data and statistical code made available for some ability to replicate analyses • Extensive methodology description • No monetization of ratings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None discussed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive methodology description • Detailed scores and rankings are published in methodology report for top hospitals 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public information on website about how they monetize their product (costs of using emblems, promotional materials, etc.)
Con			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Important details missing from methodology report (e.g., details on weighting approach) • Not transparent how all measures are weighted; weighting is vetted by Technical Expert Panel and stakeholders, but no further details • Unclear rationale for some methodological decisions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Much less transparent than other systems • Proprietary models that are not transparent • Inadequate information to judge validity and appropriateness of methodological decisions • No public information on how they monetize their product (e.g., costs of using emblems, promotional materials, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reputation survey data are not made available for analysis and verification • No public information how they monetize their product (e.g., costs of using emblems, promotional materials, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None discussed

Source: The Authors. Details of the rating process are available at www.RatingTheRaters.org

NEJM Catalyst (catalyst.nejm.org) © Massachusetts Medical Society