

# Rating the Raters – Strengths and Weaknesses Assessment of the Four Public Hospital Quality Rating Systems

The comments in the table below reflect the discussion that the Rating-the-Raters group had about each rating system. These comments for each rating system were provided to the leaders of that rating system to solicit feedback.

## Importance/Impact

(CMS) Hospital Compare Overall Star Ratings	Healthgrades Top Hospitals	USNWR (U.S. News & World Report) Best Hospitals	Leapfrog Hospital Safety Grade and Leapfrog Top Hospitals
<b>Pro</b>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Compiled by largest payer in U.S.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Procedure- and condition-specific rankings</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Overall, specialty and procedure/condition rankings are helpful</li> <li>• Useful and rigorous rating system overall</li> <li>• High-complexity and high-acuity measures where quality tends to vary, but also focuses on more common procedure areas</li> <li>• Measures generally have high face validity</li> <li>• Inclusion of registry data (STS data for CABG and AVR) in procedure/condition rankings</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Focus on safety</li> <li>• Includes assessment of culture of safety</li> </ul>
<b>Con</b>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Very few elective condition- or procedure-specific measures (most are less common conditions or not elective admissions)</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Paucity of clinically meaningful and rigorous outcomes data (e.g., mortality considered quality metric and not safety metric)</li> <li>• No information for individual common elective procedures/conditions</li> <li>• Safety focused, but misses a lot of other important measures for quality and should be more balanced</li> </ul>	

Source: The Authors. Details of the rating process are available at [www.RatingTheRaters.org](http://www.RatingTheRaters.org)

NEJM Catalyst ([catalyst.nejm.org](http://catalyst.nejm.org)) © Massachusetts Medical Society